

The Polyphonic Songs Attributed to Pedro de Escobar

Tess Knighton

ICREA
Institució Milà i Fontanals – CSIC
t.knighton@imf.csic.es

Resumo

Este breve estudo das dezanove canções atribuídas a Pedro de Escobar, todas, com exceção de um vilancico de Natal, incluídas no *Cancionero Musical de Palacio*, pretende contextualizá-las textual e musicalmente no conjunto das fontes onde foram copiadas. Embora seja ainda necessário um trabalho aprofundado sobre a estrutura e a datação do *Cancionero Musical de Palacio*, é possível, através da análise musical, avançar com a hipótese de algumas das canções terem sido copiadas antes e outras mais tarde, provavelmente dos finais da década de 1490 até cerca de meados da segunda década do século XVI. Três canções, em particular, foram amplamente difundidas, especialmente em fontes portuguesas da segunda metade do século XVI. Somente uma é encontrada numa fonte não ibérica e parece ter particular relação com Juan del Encina, cujo estilo é adoptado e imitado por Escobar nas suas canções. Estas obras abrangem uma razoável diversidade de temas, reflectindo globalmente o conteúdo do *Cancionero Musical de Palacio*, desde as canções no estilo popular do *cosaute*, que eram frequentemente executadas em contraponto semi-improvisado como parte do entretenimento da corte, ao mais elaborado vilancico segundo o modelo de Encina, com ocasionais momentos de imitação e atenção ao sentido do texto. Os elementos populares são incorporados de diversos modos, especialmente em *Virgen bendita sin par* de Escobar, que cita uma canção popular preservada em diferentes formas, à maneira das canções devocionais de Ambrosio Montesino cantadas ‘al tono de’ uma melodia conhecida. Por fim, é explorada uma canção na perspectiva de recolher possíveis pistas biográficas e indícios do paradeiro de Encina, do poeta e violista Garci Sánchez de Badajoz e de Escobar, antes de este ser chamado para o serviço da Catedral de Sevilha em 1507.

Palavras-chave

Pedro de Escobar; Juan del Encina; Garci Sánchez de Badajoz; *Cosaute*; Vilancico; *Contrapunto*; *Cancionero Musical de Palacio*.

Abstract

This brief assessment of the nineteen songs attributed to Pedro de Escobar, all, with the exception of one Christmas villancico, in the *Palace Songbook*, attempts to place them in context in terms of the sources in which they were copied, their texts and their musical style. Although much work remains to be done on the structure and dating of the *Palace Songbook*, it is possible, through musical analysis, to posit that some songs can be considered to have been copied earlier and others later, probably from the later 1490s into about the middle of the second decade of the sixteenth century. Three songs were particularly widely diffused, notably in Portuguese sources of the latter part of the sixteenth century; only one is found in a non-Iberian source and would seem to have a particular connection to Juan del Encina, whose style is adopted and imitated by Escobar in his songs. These songs embrace a fairly wide range of

themes, reflecting the content of the *Palace Songbook* as a whole, from the popular *cosaute*-style songs which was often performed in semi-improvised *contrapunto* as part of court entertainment, to the more elaborate villancico in the Encinian mould, with occasional hints of imitation and attention to the meaning of the words. Popular elements are introduced in a variety of ways, notably in Escobar's *Virgen bendita sin par*, which cites a popular song that is preserved in a number of different guises, in the manner of Ambrosio Montesino's devotional songs sung 'al tono de' a well-known melody. Finally, one song is assessed for possible biographical clues, and a hint towards the triangulation of the whereabouts of Encina, the poet-vihuelist Garci Sánchez de Badajoz and Escobar before he was called to serve at Seville Cathedral in 1507.

Keywords

Pedro de Escobar; Juan del Encina; Garci Sánchez de Badajoz; *Cosaute*; Villancico; *Contrapunto*; *Palace Songbook* (*Cancionero Musical de Palacio*).

THE *CANCIONERO* REPERTORY FROM THE TIME of the Catholic Monarchs has received a considerable amount of attention from literary scholars in recent years, but relatively little from music historians.¹ With the exception of Juan del Encina,² individual composers of polyphonic settings of lyric verse from around 1500 have not been studied in their capacity as song composers since Robert Stevenson's pioneering *Spanish Music in the Age of Columbus* (1960).³ In general terms, some insightful thoughts on the earlier generation of *cancionero* composers have been published by David Fallows,⁴ and Jane Whetnall's contributions have consistently raised important issues relating to the creative background to song composition,⁵ but there is still remarkably little on individual composers.⁶ The musical songbooks themselves, in terms of their origins, compilation and dating, have come under some scrutiny since Stevenson's day,⁷ and a little

¹ For a recent and very useful overview, see Jane WHETNALL, 'Secular Song in Fifteenth-Century Spain', in *Companion to Music in the Age of the Catholic Monarchs*, edited by Tess Knighton, Brill's Companions to the Musical Culture of Medieval and Early Modern Europe 1 (Leiden - Boston, Brill, 2017), pp. 60-96.

² Roy O. JONES and Carolyn LEE (ed.), *Juan del Encina. Poesía lírica y cancionero musical* (Madrid, Clásicos Castalia, 1975).

³ Robert STEVENSON, *Spanish Music in the Age of Columbus* (The Hague, Martin Nijhoff, 1960).

⁴ David FALLOWS, 'A Glimpse of the Lost Years: Spanish Polyphonic Song (1450-1470)', in *New Perspectives in Music. Essays in Honor of Eileen Southern*, edited by Josephine Wright and Samuel A. Floyd, Detroit Monographs in Musicology/Studies in Music 11 (Warren, MI, Harmonie Park Press, 1992), pp. 19-36.

⁵ For example, see Jane WHETNALL, 'Songs and Canciones in the *Cancionero general* of 1511', in *The Age of the Catholic Monarchs, 1474-1516: Literary Studies in Memory of Keith Whinnom*, edited by Alan Deyermond and Ian Macpherson (Liverpool, Liverpool University Press, 1989), pp. 197-207.

⁶ The studies on the identity of Garci Sánchez de Badajoz offer useful contributions to the general understanding of the court poet-musician; see Emilio ROS-FÁBREGAS, '"Badajoz el Músico" y Garci Sánchez de Badajoz: Identificación de un poeta-músico andaluz del Renacimiento', in *Música y literatura en la España de la Edad Media y del Renacimiento*, edited by Virginie Dumanoir (Madrid, Casa de Velázquez, 2003), pp. 55-75; and Martin G. CUNNINGHAM, '"Discantando la pasión": Garci Sánchez de Badajoz and the Art of Renaissance Song', in *A Lifetime's Reading: Hispanic Essays for Patrick Gallagher*, edited by Don W. Cruickshank (Dublin, University College Dublin Press, 1999), pp. 44-59.

⁷ For a recent summary, see Emilio ROS-FÁBREGAS, 'Manuscripts of Polyphony', in *Companion to Music* (see note 1), pp. 404-68; and Ángel OLMOS SÁEZ, 'En torno al Cancionero Musical de Palacio y el Cancionero de Segovia. Análisis de su origen y utilidad', *Nassarre: Revista Aragonesa de Musicología*, 28/1 (2012), pp. 43-66.

more is now known about them, though much remains to be studied. In the preparation of this brief assessment of Pedro de Escobar as a song composer, it was still necessary to rely on José Romeu Figueras's monumental study of 1965 and, as the context for Ros-Fábregas's recent findings, the Spanish philologist's summary of the compilation and dating of the different layers of the *Cancionero Musical de Palacio*.⁸

Perhaps the most significant change since Stevenson's 1960 study concerns Escobar's biography. Stevenson believed that Pedro de Escobar and Pedro de Porto could be considered one and the same person,⁹ but recent research has shown that this could not have been the case since the two musicians are recorded simultaneously as being chapel masters at Seville and Valencia cathedrals in the same years.¹⁰ While this does not *per se* affect the attribution to 'Escobar' of eighteen songs in the *Cancionero Musical de Palacio*,¹¹ and one more in a recently-discovered fragment,¹² it may indeed be relevant to the anonymous *romance Nina era la infanta* in the sixteenth-century manuscript discovered in the library of Dr Ivo Cruz in Lisbon in the early 1990s (*P-Ln* CIC 60, henceforth Lisbon 60).¹³ Furthermore, since what is known about Escobar's biography is now reduced to the seven years (1507-14) when he is documented as working at Seville Cathedral, the dating and dissemination of his songs has become still more problematic.¹⁴ This brief article makes no pretence of resolving these intractable problems,¹⁵ but offers instead a reconsideration of Escobar's songs in the light of these recent findings and of the analytical work done for the *Anatomy of Late 15th- and Early 16th-Century Iberian Polyphonic Music* project based at CESEM, Universidade NOVA de Lisboa.

⁸ JOSÉ ROMEU FIGUERAS, *La música en la corte de los Reyes Católicos*, IV-1: *Cancionero Musical de Palacio (siglos XV-XVI)*, 3-A (Barcelona, Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas, 1965); IV-2: *Cancionero Musical de Palacio (siglos XV-XVI)*, 3-B includes the song texts and Romeu Figueras's commentary on them, with concordances.

⁹ STEVENSON, *Spanish Music* (see note 3), pp. 167-71; Robert STEVENSON, 'Pedro de Escobar: Earliest Portuguese Composer in New World Colonial Music', *Inter-American Music Review*, 11/1 (1990), pp. 3-24.

¹⁰ FRANCESC VILLANUEVA SERRANO, 'La identificación de Pedro de Escobar con Pedro de Porto: Una revisión definitiva a la luz de nuevos datos', *Revista de Musicología*, 34/1 (2011), pp. 37-58.

¹¹ The three- and four-voice settings of 'Paséisme aor' allá serrana' are counted separately; both are assumed to be by Escobar, since the four-voice setting, although it does not bear an ascription, simply adds a fourth voice to the three-voice version. On the concordances for Escobar's songs, see Table 1 below.

¹² See Maricarmen GÓMEZ MUNTANÉ, 'Fray Ambrosio de Montesino y el repertorio navideño cancioneril, con especial atención al bifolio carp. 3/16 del Archivo Histórico Provincial de Orense', *Cuadernos de Música Iberoamericana*, 27 (2014), pp. 27-47; and Tess KNIGHTON, 'Spanish Songs for Christmas Eve from the Early 16th Century', *Early Music*, 43/3 (2015), pp. 455-69.

¹³ OWEN REES, 'Texts and Music in Lisbon BN 60', *Revista de Musicología*, 16/3 (1993), pp. 1515-33; and OWEN REES, 'Manuscript Lisbon, Biblioteca Nacional, CIC Ms 60: The Repertories and their Context', *Revista Portuguesa de Musicología*, 4-5 (1994-5), pp. 53-93.

¹⁴ JUAN RUIZ JIMÉNEZ, "'The Sounds of the Hollow Mountain': Musical Tradition and Innovation in Seville Cathedral in the Early Renaissance', *Early Music History*, 29 (2010), pp. 189-239, at p. 234; and JUAN RUIZ JIMÉNEZ, 'Cathedral Soundscapes: Some New Perspectives', in *Companion to Music* (see note 1), pp. 242-81, at p. 272.

¹⁵ Problems that will persist unless new documents emerge to shed further light on Escobar's career, and/or until a scholar such as Ros-Fábregas revises further Romeu Figueras's work on the copying layers of the *Palace Songbook*.

Escobar set a variety of poetic texts to music and composed songs in a fairly wide range of styles, but there is little evidence to help with their date of composition. All but one of the songs ascribed to him are copied in the *Palace Songbook* (*E-Mp* II/1335, generally known as the *Cancionero Musical de Palacio* or *CMP*); three of these have concordances in the *Cancioneiro de Elvas* (*P-Em* 11793), believed to have been copied in the third quarter of the sixteenth century,¹⁶ and one of these, *Pásame, por Dios, barquero*, is found both in Elvas and Lisbon 60. The melodies of both *Lo que queda es lo seguro* and *Secáronme los pesares* are included in the *Cancioneiro de Paris*, a manuscript of both monophonic and polyphonic songs, the original layer of which is thought to date from c.1550-70 and which was thus copied earlier than either Elvas and Lisbon 60.¹⁷ Both monophonic songs have variants, especially at cadence points, but are still recognizably the melodies used by Escobar in his polyphonic versions. *Lo que queda es lo seguro*, is also preserved in the Florentine manuscript, Florence, Biblioteca Nazionale Centrale, Magl. XIX 107bis,¹⁸ the only song by Escobar to appear in a non-Iberian manuscript; it will be discussed below with regard to the possible connections between Escobar and Juan del Encina (see Table 1).

<i>CMP</i>	ff.	Title	vv	<i>Cancioneiro de Elvas</i>	Lisbon 60	<i>Cancioneiro de Paris</i>	Florence
216	129	<i>Lo que queda es lo seguro</i> *	3	47v-48: modified version		34v-35: melody only, with minor changes	59: minor changes; different vs 2
357	232	<i>Pásame, por Dios, barquero</i>	3	95v-96: minor changes	39v-40: reworking		
199	119v-120	<i>Secáronme los pesares</i>	3	41v-42: modified version		22v-23: melody only, decorated	

*A version of *Lo que queda es lo seguro* is also found in Enríquez de Valderrábano's *Silva de Sirenas* (Valladolid, 1547), ff. 93-93v: Soneto XXII 'a Sonada de Lo que queda es lo seguro'; this setting for vihuela is based on a similar melody.

Table 1. Musical concordances for Escobar's songs

¹⁶ Gil MIRANDA (ed.), *Cancioneiro de Elvas (The Elvas Songbook)* (Neuhausen - Stuttgart, American Institute of Musicology, 1987), pp. xviii-xix; Manuel Pedro FERREIRA, 'Introduction', in *Cancioneiro da Biblioteca Publica Hortensia de Elvas*, Lusitania Musica 1. Opera musica selecta 3 (Lisbon, Instituto Português do Património Cultural, 1989), pp. v-xxv.

¹⁷ See Nuno de Mendonça RAIMUNDO's contribution to this issue entitled 'The Dating of the *Cancioneiro de Paris* and a Timeline of Its Formation', *Portuguese Journal of Musicology, new series*, 6/1 (2019), pp. 211-32. Transcriptions of the melodies, with the lower voices reconstructed from the *CMP*, are found in Nuno de Mendonça RAIMUNDO, 'O Cancioneiro de Paris: Uma nova perspectiva sobre o manuscrito F-Peb Masson 56', 2 vols. (Master's thesis, Universidade Nova de Lisboa, 2017), II: 11 (*Lo que queda es lo seguro*) and 22 (*Secáronme los pesares*). I am very grateful to Nuno de Mendonça Raimundo for drawing my attention to these monophonic versions.

¹⁸ *I-Fn* MS Magl. XIX.107bis. Digitized images of this manuscript are available through DIAMM. On Encina's songs in this manuscript, see: Miguel QUEROL GAVALDÀ, 'La producción musical de Juan del Encina', *Anuario Musical*, 24 (1969), pp. 121-31.

This preponderance of later Portuguese concordances for these songs reflects the longevity in terms of appeal and performance of the Castilian-texted song repertory in Portugal. While Owen Rees, in his preliminary study of Lisbon 60, suggested a date of c.1530-50,¹⁹ João Pedro d'Alvarenga has more recently proposed a later dating of around 1570, based on palaeographic and codicological evidence.²⁰ Both the Portuguese sources are thus from substantially later in the sixteenth century and present Escobar's songs in more or less modified versions. Alvarenga has studied the different versions, both musically and textually, of *Pásame, por Dios, barquero* in some detail,²¹ and noted the proximity of the Elvas reading to that of the *Palace Songbook*, and the distance of both from Lisbon 60, suggesting that the copyist for the latter had a different exemplar to hand. He also notes that the Lisbon scribe has 'modernized' the octave leap in the bassus at cadence points so that the bassus, and not the tenor, carries the *finalis*, as would be expected in a late-sixteenth-century source. However, in the Elvas version, two cadential octave leaps in the bassus are preserved in the *estribillo*, although this feature is modernized in *Secáronme los pesares* (at the end of the *estribillo* and the *coplas*) and in three instances in *Lo que queda es lo seguro*, and both of these songs undergo substantial revision in Elvas. The notable proximity of the music of *Pásame, por Dios, barquero* in manuscripts separated by at least sixty years is especially curious given that three significant text changes, as noted by Alvarenga, are common to both Elvas and Lisbon 60. The preservation of the octave leap in the bassus here seems to have been an anomaly (see below).

As mentioned above, the dating and compilation of the *Palace Songbook* has recently been called into question by Emilio Ros-Fábregas who proposes, on the basis of codicological factors such as the colour of the ink used and the dating of watermarks, that the original section of the manuscript is located (rather than at the beginning as assumed by Romeu Figueras) at its heart, with the section of *romances* (ff. 51v-60v), and another of villancicos, almost all by Juan del Encina and beginning with his *No tienen vado mis males* (ff. 99v-113v). These sections, Ros-Fábregas suggests, may well have been copied in Salamanca, while Encina was in the service of the Duke of Alba in the 1490s.²² If this were indeed the case—and it is made convincingly—the eleven layers of additional copying established by José Romeu Figueras would need to be revised, especially what he considered to be the original layer, with its four subsections. In addition, and following Carolyn

¹⁹ REES, 'Manuscript Lisbon' (see note 13), pp. 63-4.

²⁰ João Pedro d'ALVARENGA, 'On the Transmission of Iberian Polyphonic Music in the Early Decades of the Sixteenth Century: Some Philological Issues Revisited', *Portuguese Journal of Musicology, new series*, 6/1 (2019), pp. 5-28.

²¹ ALVARENGA, 'On the Transmission of Iberian Polyphonic Music' (see note 20).

²² ROS-FÁBREGAS, 'Manuscripts of Polyphony' (see note 7), pp. 418-22.

Lee's work on the manuscript in the late 1970s,²³ Romeu Figueras's dating of layers 6 (1515) and 10 (1516) are also shown to be insecure, and more likely to date from the first decade of the sixteenth century.²⁴ Much work remains to be done, however, and for the present study reference will continue to be made to Romeu-Figueras's identification of the various layers of the *Palace Songbook*. None of Escobar's songs are included in the kernel of the *Palace Songbook* as proposed by Ros-Fábregas, although two—*Virgen bendita sin par* and *O alto bien*—are considered by Romeu Figueras as having been added at later dates (layers 6 and 10 respectively) and should very probably now be considered to date from the early years of the sixteenth century rather than its second decade.

Although some of Romeu Figueras's findings as regards the compilation of the *Palace Songbook* are now disputed, it does seem that three clusters of songs by Escobar were added to the original body of the manuscript, each cluster being copied by the same hand and at approximately the same time (see Table 2).

f/ff.	Title	CMP	Layer RF	Theme
Cluster 1				
119v-120	<i>Secáronme los pesares</i>	199	O-3; <i>Tabula</i>	courtly love; unrequited
232	<i>Pásame, por Dios, barquero</i>	357	O-3; <i>Tabula</i>	courtly love; (de)parting
254v	<i>El día que vy</i>	383	O-3; <i>Tabula</i>	courtly love; shepherdess-knight
Cluster 2				
129	<i>Lo que queda es lo seguro</i>	216	2; <i>Tabula</i>	courtly love; unrequited
130	<i>No devo dar culpa</i>	220	2; <i>Tabula</i>	courtly love; unrequited
134	<i>Nuestr'ama, Minguillo</i>	229	2; <i>Tabula</i>	bucolic; festive
151	<i>Ojos morenicos</i>	263	2; <i>Tabula</i>	courtly love; eyes
255v-256	<i>Gran plaser siento yo ya</i>	385	2; <i>Tabula</i>	bucolic; festive
Cluster 3				
43	<i>Las mis penas</i>	59	5; added to <i>Tabula</i>	popular (mother)
69	<i>No pueden dormir mis ojos</i>	114	5; added to <i>Tabula</i>	popular (mother)
95v	<i>Quedaos, adiós</i>	158	5; added to <i>Tabula</i>	(de)parting; Seville
141	<i>Paséisme aor' allá a 3</i>	244	5; added to <i>Tabula</i>	(de)parting; <i>serrana</i> - knight
141	<i>Paséisme aor' allá a 4</i>	245		
204v	<i>Vençedores son tus ojos</i>	286	5; added to <i>Tabula</i>	courtly love; eyes

Table 2. Clusters of songs by Escobar in the *Palace Songbook*

²³ Carolyn LEE, 'Spanish Polyphonic Song, c.1460-1535', 2 vols. (PhD dissertation, University of London, 1980), vol. 1, p. 52.

²⁴ ROS-FÁBREGAS, 'Manuscripts of Polyphony' (see note 7), pp. 419, 424, 426-7.

Romeu Figueras dates the three layers in which clusters of Escobar's songs were copied into the *Palace Songbook* from the first decade or decade and a half of the sixteenth century. Three were copied in what he considered to be the third subsection of the original layer of the manuscript (cluster 1), which may, according to Ros-Fábregas's findings, not have been the original layer, though the dating of around 1500 may well remain unchanged. These three songs and the five that Romeu Figueras placed in layer 2 (cluster 2), were listed in alphabetical order in the original *Tabula*, at whichever stage it might have been copied,²⁵ while the six songs (including the two settings of *Paséisme aor' allá, serrana*) grouped in layer 5 were added to it at a later point, their titles being squeezed in between the original sequence, in an informal hand and with no use of red ink to indicate the foliation (cluster 3). A further indication that cluster 1 does in fact predate the other two is suggested by Escobar's consistent use of the octave-leap bassus at main cadences in these three songs (which include *Pásame, por Dios, barquero*), a procedure that is generally considered to be a compositional feature of before 1500. All three songs are for three voices. The second cluster exhibits the kind of mixed approach characteristic of the early years of the sixteenth century, with three of the five songs having a tenor *finalis*.²⁶ Of this cluster, only one, *Gran plazer siento yo ya*, is for four voices, making use of this expansion to present contrasting duos; it nevertheless has the bassus leap of the octave at internal and end-of-section cadences. None of the six songs of cluster 3 have the bassus leap an octave at cadence points, even in those for three voices, *Paséisme aor'allá, serrana* and *Vençedores son tus ojos*. The three clusters would thus suggest some correlation between use of the octave leap at cadences—and, to some extent, of the shift from three- to four-voice settings—and the earlier and slightly later copying of the songs in the *Palace Songbook*.²⁷

The remaining 'odd' songs—where only one song by Escobar appears to have been copied in a single layer as identified by Romeu Figueras—do not clarify the pattern, but nor do they detract from it. The three-voice *Coraçón triste, sofrid* (CMP 375; layer 1) appears in the original layer of the *Tabula*, while the four-voice *Virgen bendita sin par* (CMP 416) was added to it; neither uses the octave-leap cadence. The four-voice *¡Ora sus! –Pues así es* (CMP 73), in Romeu Figueras's layer 4, does not appear in the *Tabula*, although the three-voice *O alto bien*, placed in layer 10, which Ros-Fábregas has identified as a discreet manuscript that was subsumed into the whole and not

²⁵ Romeu Figueras suggests that the *tabula* was drawn up after the addition of what he terms Layer 2, which is contested by Ros-Fábregas since the *tabula* omits all the *canciones* from what is now the beginning of the *Palace Songbook* (Romeu Figueras's original layer) (ROS-FÁBREGAS, 'Manuscripts of Polyphony' (see note 7), pp. 418-9).

²⁶ Half of all Escobar's songs have the *finalis* in the tenor, and half in the bassus. More detailed analysis shows that there is no particular correlation between the octave leap in the bassus and the mode, genre or theme of the songs in question.

²⁷ Further analysis of the 29 songs (mostly by Encina) copied at the same time as Cluster 1, the 34 (three lost) as Cluster 2, and 151 (34 lost) as Cluster 3 might prove useful, despite the range of composers involved.

represented in the *Tabula*,²⁸ does appear there as a later addition. The octave leap is found in both *¡Ora sus! –Pues así es* and *O alto bien* (though only at the cadence at the end of the *coplas*) suggesting that these were possibly among Escobar's earlier songs, in accordance with the earlier date proposed for layers 10 by Ros-Fábregas.

It appears, then, that there may be a broad correlation between composition date and likely copying date in the *Palace Songbook*, which might reflect something of the chronology of Escobar's songs, although they must all have been in circulation in the last years of the fifteenth century and the first decade and a half of the sixteenth century, during which the *Palace Songbook* was copied in its various stages. In general, Escobar's songs circulated relatively little: the texts of twelve of the nineteen songs ascribed to him are *unica*, found only in the *Palace Songbook*, to which can be added the Christmas song from the Ourense bi-folium.²⁹ As mentioned, only one of Escobar's songs, *Lo que queda es lo seguro* (CMP 216), is found in a non-Iberian musical manuscript, (Florence). David Fallows summarises the evidence that the works by Obrecht in the Florence manuscript were copied after their publication by Petrucci in 1503, and suggests that the copying date was nearer to 1510,³⁰ with a *terminus ante quem* of 1513 relating to the reference in the manuscript to Giovanni de Medici as a cardinal rather than pope (Leo X) as he became in that year. The copying of Florence was thus contemporaneous with much of the compilation of the *Palace Songbook*. The Florence setting of *Lo que queda es lo seguro*, a widely known poem by Garci Sánchez de Badajoz, is almost exactly concordant with the version in the *Palace Songbook*, with one variant in the bassus at bar 9 (E instead of C, resulting in the first inversion of the chord), and another at bar 11, where the *échappé* in the superius falls to F in Florence and to D in the *Palace Songbook* (see Example 1).³¹

The first of these variants, in the bassus, is also found in Elvas, suggesting a common source other than the *Palace Songbook*. In Florence's highly Italianicized version of Badajoz's poem,³² there are also significant textual variants in the *coplas* and the *vuelta*: 'partida del coraçon / del dolor con que partí. / Mas los ojos con que os vi...' becomes 'cautiva del corazon / por el dolor ch'io senti. / Los ogios con che lo ves mi...' in Florence.³³ The second verse, copied in the lower

²⁸ ROS-FÁBREGAS, 'Manuscripts of Polyphony' (see note 7), pp. 419-20.

²⁹ The notably small degree of overlap between musical and non-musical *cancioneros*—in particular Hernando de Castillo's vast printed anthology of the repertory, the *Cancionero general* (1511)—may well stem from different patterns of circulation for musical settings, which Castillo, for example, probably did not have to hand; see WHETNALL, 'Secular Song' (see note 1), pp. 91-2.

³⁰ David FALLOWS, *A Catalogue of Polyphonic Songs, 1415-1480* (Oxford, Oxford University Press, 1999), pp. 16-7.

³¹ Both variants are found in the *estribillo* and in the *coplas* where the music is repeated.

³² With 'ch' instead of 'qu' ('che' 'cheda', 'ch'io' etc.), and 'gi' in 'prigion', 'ogios' etc.

³³ The copyist of Florence has written out the *vuelta* after the *coplas* suggesting that he felt the need to clarify the verse form of the villancico.

margin in Florence, also differs from that of the *Palace Songbook*, and from the second verse found in the 1520 and later editions of the *Cancionero general*.³⁴ The poem's appearance in the 1511 edition confirms that it was in wide circulation by this time; the *Palace Songbook* may have been its first outing, the only possibly earlier manuscript copy being *BL1*, which Dutton dates as before 1500, but which is now considered to postdate the 1511 *Cancionero general*.³⁵



Example 1a. Escobar, *Lo que queda es lo seguro*, bb. 9-12 (*MadP* 1335, f. 129)



Example 1b. Escobar, *Lo que queda es lo seguro*, bb. 9-12 (*Elvas*, ff. 47v-48)



Example 1c. Escobar, *Lo que queda es lo seguro*, bb. 9.12 (*Florence*, f. 59)

³⁴ The first edition of the *Cancionero general* of 1511 only presents one verse, the same as found in the *Palace Songbook*, but the editions of 1520, 1527, 1540 and 1557 have the second strophe. *LB1* has four different added verses that are in general not considered to be by Sánchez de Badajoz; see *Cancionero de Sánchez de Badajoz*, edited by Julià Castillo (Madrid, Editora Nacional, 1980), pp. 118-9.

³⁵ Brian DUTTON, *Catálogo-índice de la poesía cancioneril del siglo XV* (Madison WI, The Hispanic Seminary of Medieval Studies, 1982), pp. 10-20.

The presence of *Lo que queda es lo seguro* in Florence, copied alongside three songs by Juan del Encina, raises questions about a possible relationship between Escobar and the eponymous poet-composer;³⁶ might Encina have been responsible for the transmission of Escobar's song to Italy? This would by no means have been the only possible route, but it is a suggestive one given other hints at a connection between the two composers. In addition to the clear influence of Encina on Escobar's song style (discussed below), Escobar set the refrain of Encina's *Vencedores son tus ojos* (CMP 286) which was included in his printed *Cancionero* of 1496, thus giving a likely *terminus post quem* for Escobar's setting.³⁷ However, the two verses copied in the *Palace Songbook* do not correspond to any of the nine verses included in the 1496 *Cancionero*, suggesting that the song was in general circulation and had already been glossed by another poet when Escobar set it polyphonically. In other words, this possible point of contact remains difficult to pin down.

Is it possible that the composers knew each other? Encina is known to have reached Rome in about 1499, but his exact whereabouts between his time in Salamanca and leaving for Italy are unknown.³⁸ Robert Stevenson suggested that he might have visited Portugal in the months before he went to Italy on the basis of his song *Quédate, carillo, adiós* (CMP 304), which, like other works by Encina, includes autobiographical material.³⁹ This lengthy villancico of twenty verses takes the form of a dialogue between Juan (presumably Encina) and an unnamed 'compañero'; it was not included in the *Cancionero* of 1496 and very probably dates from after Encina's unsuccessful bid to become chapel master at Salamanca Cathedral in 1498, an event referred to in his *Égloga de las grandes lluvias* of that year.⁴⁰ Both Romeu Figueras and Jones and Lee suggest that *Quédate, carillo, adiós* makes reference to Encina's decision to leave Salamanca and seek his fortune elsewhere. The last line of the refrain refers to the poet 'Juan's' desire to go to Estremoz ('A Estremo[z] quiero pasar'), presumably to seek favour in Portuguese court circles. It is not known if he did so, nor is it currently established where Escobar was in 1498-9 (nor whether he was, in fact, Spanish or Portuguese), but given the constant exchange of poets, musicians and others between Portugal and Spain during this period,⁴¹ their paths may have crossed, and Encina could have encountered Escobar's song—very much in the style of Encina's own villancicos—and taken it to Italy with him. If this were the case,

³⁶ Encina's three songs in Florence are: *Todos los bienes del mundo* (f. 57v); *Tan bien ghanadigho* (f. 58); and *Caldero et glave madona* (f. 58v) (JONES - LEE, *Juan del Encina. Poesía lírica* (see note 2), p. 54). Escobar's *Lo que queda es lo seguro* follows immediately on in the manuscript.

³⁷ Although it is possible that Escobar came across the song in performance or in manuscript form before it was printed.

³⁸ Richard SHERR, 'A Note on the Biography of Juan del Encina', *Bulletin of the Comediantes*, 34/2 (1982), pp. 159-72.

³⁹ STEVENSON, *Spanish Music* (see note 3), p. 256.

⁴⁰ ROMEU FIGUERAS, *La música*, IV-2 (see note 8), pp. 404-6; and JONES - LEE, *Juan del Encina. Poesía lírica* (see note 2), pp. 10-1.

⁴¹ On the cultural porosity between Spain and Portugal at this time, see Bernadette NELSON, 'Music and Musicians at the Portuguese Royal Court and Chapel, c.1470-c.1500', in *Companion to Music* (see note 1), pp. 205-41, especially at pp. 230-6.

then *Vençedores son tus ojos* would have a *terminus ante quem* of the very end of the fifteenth century. The relationship of *Quédate, Carrillo, adios* with Escobar's is quite possibly also autobiographical, is discussed below.

Three texts set by Escobar circulated widely throughout the sixteenth century: the two by Sánchez de Badajoz, *Lo que queda es lo seguro* and *Secáronme los pesares* (CMP 199) and *Pásame, por Dios, barquero*. All inspired glosses and versions *a lo divino*, and were included in anthologies and/or featured in *pliegos sueltos*, a sure sign of popular reach. Both *Lo que queda es lo seguro* and *Pásame, por Dios, barquero* were included in Francisco de Ocaña's much later collection entitled *Cancionero para cantar la noche de Navidad y las fiestas de Pascua* (Alcalá de Henares, Juan Gracián, 1603), a longevity also reflected in the musical versions in the later Portuguese musical *cancioneros*. *Secáronme los pesares*, like *Lo que queda es lo seguro*, featured in several editions of the *Cancionero general*, and both poems also appeared in *a lo divino* versions in the *Cancionero espiritual... hecho por un religioso de la orden del bienaventurado Sant Hierónimo*, printed by Juan de Villalquarán in Valladolid in 1549. Two further aspects of the diffusion of Sánchez de Badajoz's *Secáronme los pesares* are worth noting here: first, its inclusion in the manuscript Madrid, Biblioteca de Palacio, Ms. 1579, an early sixteenth-century *cancionero* with many close readings with the *Palace Songbook*,⁴² and, second, its appearance as a contrafactum *a lo divino* among the verse of the Portuguese poet and playwright Francisco Sá de Miranda (1491-1558), another example of the constant cultural exchange between Spain and Portugal.

As has been mentioned above, in 1507 Escobar was called from Portugal to Seville where he stayed until early 1514. Many of his songs would easily have passed into the song repertory circulating in court circles during these years, wherever the *Palace Songbook* was compiled; although there is no direct evidence, it may well have passed from the Duke of Alba to King Ferdinand, whose households were closely linked over several decades.⁴³ Ferdinand's retinue (including his chapel) visited Seville from late October 1508, when he made a triumphal entry into the city,⁴⁴ and on 10 December of that year, and again, for almost six months between February and June 1511.⁴⁵ Nothing can be concluded from this, except that Escobar's years in Seville coincided

⁴² The three verses of *Secáronme los pesares* are shared between the two sources, although in Ms. 1579 a fourth is added between verses one and two as they are found in the music manuscript.

⁴³ Roberta FREUND SCHWARTZ, 'Love and Liberality? Music in the Courts of the Spanish Nobility', in *Companion to Music* (see note 1), pp. 173-204.

⁴⁴ Tess KNIGHTON and Carmen MORTE GARCÍA, 'Ferdinand of Aragon's Entry into Valladolid: The Triumph of a Christian King', *Early Music History*, 18 (1991), pp. 119-63.

⁴⁵ Antonio RUMEU DE ARMAS, *Itinerario de los Reyes Católicos, 1474-1516* (Madrid, Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas, 1974), pp. 348-9 and 370-2.

with the period in which many songs were being added to the *Palace Songbook*. As mentioned above, the radical revision of his biography as a result of Villanueva's discovery makes it far less likely that Escobar was the composer of the ballad *Ninha era la infanta*. A longer and rather different version of the poem to that found in Lisbon 60 is appended to Gil Vicente's play the *Cortes de Jupiter* which was performed at the Portuguese court in Lisbon on 4 August 1521 to mark the departure of the Infanta Doña Beatriz to France to be with her husband the Duke of Savoy.⁴⁶ The published collection of Vicente's works of 1562 indicates that *Ninha era la infanta* was sung at the end of the play in four voices, and, as Rees points out, the text included in that edition fits more snugly with the musical setting in Lisbon 60 than the text presented there. Earlier in the play, Vicente makes reference to Pedro do Porto by name, and, as part of a humorous game in which members of the court given an identity as a fish, likens him to the eel: 'Com eles Pero do Porto / em figura de safio...'. *Ninha era la infante* is, therefore, more likely to have been composed by that slippery character Porto than Escobar.

Rees's analysis of the musical style of the *romance*—a genre for which no example survives with an attribution to Escobar—nevertheless points to certain stylistic elements that are found in his other works, notably the parallel movement in a double suspension to a cadence, parallel (at the fourth) passing notes, and the use of the rhythmic pattern of two minims-semibreve, usually in a falling scalar figure. In these and other respects, the musical idiom is similar to Escobar's villancicos in the *Palace Songbook*, all of which basically follow the pattern of song-setting associated with Juan del Encina. Each line of verse is demarcated by a strong cadence and sustained chord (sometimes also marked by a fermata) in all voices; each phrase begins in homophony and introduces independent movement between the voices (whether the song is in three or four voice parts) in order to bring about the cadential punctuation of the musical setting. This texture is varied on occasion with a faster, but still chordal, declamatory style, and, quite rarely, the brief use of imitation. Concise duos are also used in some of the songs which may have been originally performed in a dramatic context, but otherwise there is little contrast in texture, and musical phrases are quite often, as in *Lo que queda es lo seguro*, repeated in both the *estribillo* and the *coplas*, resulting in a strikingly hermetic impact. Such repetition is particularly, but not exclusively, associated with Escobar's three *cosaute*-like settings, and, together with the simplicity of musical structure, often based on parallel movement between at least two voices, surely reflects the semi-improvised tradition out of which notated polyphonic songs grew in the second half of the fifteenth century.⁴⁷

⁴⁶ REES, 'Texts and Music' (see note 13), pp. 1528-33.

⁴⁷ Giuseppe FIORENTINO, 'Unwritten Music and Oral Traditions at the Time of Ferdinand and Isabel', in *Companion to Music* (see note 1), pp. 504-48, especially at pp. 528-41; and see FALLOWS, 'A Glimpse of the Lost Years' (see note 4).

Lo que queda es lo seguro, Que lo que co -

Lo que queda es lo seguro, Que lo que co -

Lo que queda es lo seguro, Que lo que co -

mi - go va De - se - án - do - os mo - ri - rá.

- mi - go va De - se - án - do - os mo - ri - rá.

- mi - go va De - se - án - do - os mo - ri - rá.

Example 2a. Escobar, *estribillo* of *Lo que queda es lo seguro* with the melody in the superius

Lo que queda es lo seguro, Que lo que co -

Lo que queda es lo seguro, Que lo que co -

Lo que queda es lo seguro, Que lo que co -

mi - go va De - se - án - do - os mo - ri - rá.

- mi - go va De - se - án - do - os mo - ri - rá.

- mi - go va De - se - án - do - os mo - ri - rá.

Example 2b. Anonymous, *estribillo* of *Lo que queda es lo Seguro* with the melody in the tenor

A good example of these features is *Lo que queda es lo seguro*, a second, anonymous setting of which survives in the *Palace Songbook* (CMP 99). The same melody, with only one change in the approach to the cadence at the end of both *estribillo* and *copla*, is used in both settings: the anonymous version places the melody in the tenor, Escobar in the superius (Example 2a), and Escobar's tenor is found, in a slightly modified version, in the superius of the anonymous song. The

bassus lines are changed more substantially, although the basic harmonic outline is very similar (see Example 2b).⁴⁸

In both settings, musical phrases b and c are repeated for the *coplas* and again in the *vuelta*, making for a particularly repetitive, hermetic setting (AA'A'A), and one that shows no inclination to exploit the coincidence of text and music in the third line of the *vuelta* (C), a trait common to all Escobar's settings but occasionally found elsewhere in the *Palace Songbook*.

		Verse	Music		Cadence
<i>Estribillo</i>	Lo que queda es lo seguro,	a ⁸	a	A	G
	Que lo que comigo va	b ⁸	b		C
	<i>Deseand'os morirá.</i>	B ⁸	c		G
<i>Coplas</i>	Mi ánima queda aquí,	c ⁸	b	A'	C
	Señora, en vuestra prisión,	d ⁸	c		G
	Partida del corazón,	d ⁸	b	A'	C
	Del dolor con que partí.	c ⁸	c		G
<i>Vuelta</i>	Mas los ojos con que os vi,	c ⁸	a	A	G
	Y el cuerpo que n'os verá	b ⁸	b		C
	<i>Deseand'os morirá.</i>	B ⁸	c		G

Table 3. Textual and musical structure of Escobar's *Lo que queda es lo seguro*

The repetition of the melodic units, the use of parallel writing, whether between bassus and superius or tenor and superius, and the essentially note-against-note style which pertains even in the preparation of cadence points, all suggest that Escobar's setting had its roots in the semi-improvised tradition of *contrapunto*. The (probably) slightly later anonymous version is even more consistent in its use of parallel writing, but adds a descending scalar figure by way of a link between phrases a and b. Could this be a trace of an instrumentally accompanied performance (perhaps when played by Badajoz 'el músico' himself, given his reputation as a fine vihuela-player)?⁴⁹ Escobar's song is fully texted in the *Palace Songbook*, while the anonymous one follows the common scribal practice of full text only in the superius and incipits in the two lower voices, even though the melody is

⁴⁸ While Escobar retains the octave leap in the bassus at the cadence of the first phrase, and presents both the leap (D) and the *finalis* (G) in the final cadence, the anonymous composer eschews the octave leap at all cadence points. According to Romeu Figueras, this song was copied in Layer 5, and it thus shares the profile of the slightly later cluster of Escobar's songs (Cluster 3).

⁴⁹ According to Fray Hierónimo Román in his *Repúblicas del mundo* (Salamanca, 1595), Badajoz was 'the most skilful vihuela-player of the time of the Catholic Monarchs'; cited in *Cancionero de Sánchez* (see note 34), pp. 31-2; STEVENSON, *Spanish Music* (see note 3), p. 279; ROS-FÁBREGAS, "Badajoz el Músico" (see note 6), p. 70.

found in the tenor. Did the anonymous composer know Escobar's (probably) slightly earlier version? Or is it more likely that the two versions represent different aural interpretations of essentially the same song, but notated differently and including a number of performance-based variants? The other differences between the two versions could well be explained by the realization of the existing melody in *contrapunto*.

The relatively wide dissemination of *Lo que queda es lo seguro* may perhaps be accounted for more by Sánchez de Badajoz's poem with its classic play on conceits related to unrequited love in the courtly tradition than by the music itself which supports and punctuates the text with little in the way of elaboration. The melody used in the two versions of the song, however, is not markedly popular in tone; rather it conforms to the Encinian mix of the simplicity of popular song combined with a degree of composerly artfulness. Escobar did, however, draw on genuinely popular or traditional melodies, notably in the four-voice devotional villancico *Virgen bendita sin par* (CMP 416), in which, after the first phrase in Encinian style, the triple-time melody in the superius relates to a number of other very similar popular melodic patterns found in Francisco de Salinas's *De libri musica septem* (Salamanca, Mathias Gastius, 1577), Flecha's *ensaladas* and the *Palace Songbook* itself (Example 3).⁵⁰

The image displays six staves of musical notation, labeled a) through f), arranged vertically. Each staff is in a 3/2 time signature and features a single melodic line. The notes are primarily half notes and whole notes, with some rests. Below each staff, the corresponding Spanish lyrics are written in a simple, lowercase font, with hyphens indicating syllables that span across multiple notes. The lyrics are: a) De los án - ge - les se - ño - ra,; b) Yo me i - va a la mi ma - dre; c) De Mon - çón ve - ní - a el mo - ço,; d) An - de pues, nues - tro a - pe - lli - do; e) Bue - nas Pas - cuas y buen a - ño,; f) Yo bien pue - do ser ca - sa - da.

⁵⁰ These related melodies are discussed in Fernando RUBIO DE LA IGLESIA, 'Las melodías populares en "De musica libri septem" de Francisco de Salinas: Estudio comparado de algunos ejemplos', in *Francisco de Salinas. Música, teoría y matemática en el Renacimiento*, edited by Amaya García Pérez and Paloma Otaola González (Salamanca, Ediciones Universidad de Salamanca, 2014), pp. 219-53, at pp. 234-5.

5

Vos qu - ráis tal gra - cia dar,

A San - ta Ma - ri - a del[Pino]

Mo - ço ve - ní - a de Mon - çoñ.

el ta - ñer con el can - tar

que es des - he - cho ya el en - ga - ño.

Example 3. Comparison of a popular melody: a) Escobar, *Virgen bendita sin par*; b) Anonymous, *Menga, la del buscar*; c) Anonymous, *De Monçõn venía el moço*; d) Flecha, *La bomba*; e) Flecha, *La Justa*; f) Salinas, *Yo bien puede ser casada*

The version is used by Mateo Flecha in his *ensalada La Bomba* to the words ‘Ande pues, nuestro apellido / el tañer y el cantar’, and the melodic outline is also found at the end of his *La Justa*, with the celebratory text ‘Buenas Pascuas y buen año, / que es deshecho ya el engaño’. However, the closest readings are found in a three-voice *serranilla Menga, la del Bustar* (CMP 301) and a three-voice villancico *en cosaute* in the *Palace Songbook, De Monçõn venía el moço* (CMP 34). The *serranilla* is one of several citing songs in the *Palace Songbook*, and very similar to another mountain-girl song, *Serrana del bel mirar* (CMP 71), a monophonic version of which is also found in the *Cancioneiro de Paris*.⁵¹ The melodic reference is not set to its own text but prepares the way for the song to be cited: ‘Gurriando su ganado / Y diziendo este cantar’ (CMP 71) and ‘Carreando su ganado / Diziendo este cantar’ (*Cancioneiro de Paris* 13). In *Menga, la del bustar*, the songs to be cited are not given in the manuscript, although they are in *Serrana del bel mirar*; and, interestingly, in *Menga, la del boscal*, a version of the melody is used for the concluding psalm text ‘In exitu Israel’, suggesting that it is a prototype *ensalada* in the same way as Garcimuños’s *Una montaña pasando* (CMP 351).⁵² The text of *De Monçõn venía el moço*, although

⁵¹ The song in the *Cancioneiro de Paris, Menga, la del boscal* (ff. 27v-28) also makes brief reference to the same melody. See RAIMUNDO, ‘Cancioneiro de Paris’ (see note 17), II: 16-7. I am very grateful to Nuno de Mendonça Raimundo for drawing this to my attention.

⁵² Tess KNIGHTON, ‘A New Song in a Strange Land? Garcimuños’s *Una montaña pasando*’, in *Essays on Renaissance Music in Honour of David Fallows. Bon Jour, bon mois, bonne estrenne*, edited by Fabrice Fitch and Jacobijn Kiel, *Studies in Medieval and Renaissance Music* 11 (Woodbridge, The Boydell Press, 2011), pp. 186-97.

incomplete, is full of the double entendre and sexual innuendo characteristic of the popular genre,⁵³ while the text incipit found in Salinas—‘Yo bien puedo ser casada’ (pp. 313 and 360 of *De musica*)—also suggests the ‘malmaridada’ theme so popular at the time. In *De Monçón venía el moço* the two phrases of the melody form the two-line *estribillo* typical of the villancico *en cosaute*, while the second of these is repeated for the *coplas*. Escobar’s song of praise to the Virgin sets several lines of each verse to the complete melody which is repeated at different pitches, beginning on E, F twice, and then E again; in the anonymous *De Monçón venía el moço* the melody begins on C. Escobar twice extends the second part of this melodic formula to form a strong cadence with a 4-3 suspension in the superius. The three lower voices essentially supply harmonic support in homophonic fashion except at these more extended cadences (Example 4).

Vir - gen_ ben - di - ta sin par, De quien

Vir - gen ben - di - ta sin par, De quien

Vir - gen ben - di - ta sin par, De quien

Vir - gen ben - di - ta sin par, De quien

6

to - da vir - tud ma - na, Vos sois

to - da vir - tud ma - na, Vos sois

to - da vir - tud ma - na, Vos sois

to - da vir - tud ma - na, Vos sois

⁵³ Tess KNIGHTON, ‘Spaces and Contexts for Listening in 15th-Century Castile: The Case of the Constable’s Palace in Seville’, *Early Music*, 25/4 (1997), pp. 661-77.

10

dig - na de lo - ar.

dig - na de lo - ar.

dig - - na de lo - - ar.

dig - - na de lo - - ar.

Example 4. Escobar: *Virgen bendita sin par*

re - ci -

re - ci -

qu'en vos el Hi - jo de Dios re - ci -

qu'en vos el Hi - jo de _____ Dios re - ci -

bies - se car - ne hu - ma - na. An - te sae - cu -

bies - se car - ne hu - ma - na. An - te sae - cu -

bies - se car - ne hu - ma - na. An - te sae - cul -

bies - se car - ne hu - ma - na.

Example 5. Anonymous, *Alta reyna soberana*, end of the *estribillo*

Why Escobar chose to adopt this well-known melody, generally associated with suggestive secular texts, after the opening phrase of *Virgen bendita sin par* is not clear. The poem, of which

there are six verses in the *Palace Songbook*,⁵⁴ is refined and courtly in its imagery, with references to the Song of Solomon, the Immaculate Conception, the Virgin Mother, and the Stabat mater, as well as to the Virgin's role as intercessor and advocate before God and the Eva-Ave concept. It would nevertheless conform to the kind of devotional verse written by Ambrosio Montesino and intended to be sung to the melody of ('al tono de') a popular song.⁵⁵ Escobar's *Virgen bendita sin par* may have been conceived as just such a contrafactum which, unusually, was notated in full. The heading 'Virgen reyna soberana', added in the upper margin of the *Palace Songbook* on f. 273r, finds an echo in the anonymous, four-voice setting *Alta reyna soberana* in the *Uppsala Songbook*. While clearly a different song with a generally imitative texture, there is a further echo with Escobar's *Virgen bendita sin par* in the triple time, homophonic phrase repeated at the end of the *estribillo* and the *copla* (Example 5). It is impossible to know for certain whether this was a deliberate reference, but the combination of this distinctive triple-time phrase and the textual similarity is noteworthy.

Comparison of Escobar's three *cosaute*-like villancicos highlights once more the intertwining of courtly and popular elements. *Las mis penas, madre* (CMP 59) is the briefest of the three, with only two short phrases – one for the two-line refrain (the second of which is a *pie quebrado* of only four syllables), and one repeated for the *coplas* – and is entirely homophonic, although the quintuple mensuration makes for a lively rhythmic profile.⁵⁶ The theme of the girl confiding in her mother about her love life is traditional, while as Romeu Figueras points out, some of the orthography of the poem is archaic,⁵⁷ yet it was not copied into the *Palace Songbook* until the first decade of the sixteenth century. Romeu Figueras claims that this indicates 'una vuelta de los compositores al arte genuinamente español, de gran esquematismo, pero de profunda intensidad, operada a fines del siglo XV y principios del siguiente' ('a return on the part of composers to the genuinely Spanish art which, at the end of the fifteenth century and beginnings of the sixteenth, was highly schematic but of profound intensity'). Whether the composers' objective was to foment

⁵⁴ As Romeu Figueras points out, the music, *estribillo* and first verse are copied on ff. 272v-273, with a note in the manuscript on f. 273 to the effect that 'Las coplas hallarás atrás, a .CCXI.' where the refrain and verses 2-6 are written; he suggests that verses five and six are later additions; see ROMEU FIGUERAS, *La música* (see note 8), IV-II, p. 472.

⁵⁵ Emilio ROS-FÁBREGAS, 'Melodies for Private Devotion at the Court of Isabel of Castile', in *Queen Isabel I of Castile: Power, Patronage and Persona*, edited by Barbara F. Wiessberger (Woodbridge, Boydell & Brewer, 2008), pp. 83-107.

⁵⁶ Three other pieces in quintuple metre were copied into the *Palace Songbook* at about the same time: Anchieta, *Con amores, mis madre* (a3) (CMP 59); Encina, *Amor con fortuna* (a4) (CMP 102); and Diego Fernandes, *De ser mal casada* (a4) (CMP 197). A further song in the *Palace Songbook*—the anonymous *Y haz jura, Menga* (CMP 296)—is notated in duple time, but can be interpreted in quintuple metre; see Juan José REY, *Danzas cantadas en el Renacimiento español* (Madrid, Sociedad Española de Musicología, 1978), pp. 32-3. On the *cosaute* as a performance mode rather than a discrete genre, see Pepe REY, 'Música coral vernácula entre el Medievo y el Renacimiento', *Nassarre: Revista Aragonesa de Musicología*, 17/1 (2001), pp. 23-63, especially at pp. 42-7.

⁵⁷ ROMEU FIGUERAS, *La música* (see note 8), IV-II, p. 276.

anything resembling a national style seems less likely than the notion that the semi-improvised *cosaute*-based song continued to be a popular pastime in court circles into the sixteenth century.⁵⁸

Paséisme aor' allá, serrana, which is copied on the same folio of the *Palace Songbook* in three-voice and four-voice versions (CMP 244 and 245), is in the same mould, although in straightforward duple rather than quintuple time. Again, two musical phrases suffice, with the first line of the *estribillo* being used for the *coplas*, and the texture is almost exclusively homophonic dominated by parallel writing in both versions. This economy of melodic material allowed for quick memorization and the potential for the textual improvisation characteristic of the *cosaute*-inspired song in the court context. The *serranilla* theme bridges the popular and the courtly, with the courtier-poet seeking to escape and assuage his unrequited love with the help of the mountain-girl. *No pueden dormir mis ojos* (CMP 114) has essentially the same musical structure as *Paséisme aor' allá, serrana*, but is in triple rather than duple metre, and, like it, has a 4-3 suspension at the final cadence of the *estribillo*, adding that hint of “courtification”. The text has the freshness—and the sexual innuendo—of the *cosaute*-type song, but the language is reminiscent of the courtly love *romance*, which is intensified by the use of assonantal rhyme (i-a) throughout the *coplas* and the *vuelta*.

<i>Estribillo</i>	No pueden dormir mis ojos,	a ⁸	a
	<i>No pueden dormir.</i>	B ⁶	b
<i>Coplas</i>	Y soñava yo mi madre,	— ⁸	a
	Dos oras antes del día,	c ⁸	a
	Que me florecía la rrosa.	— ⁸	a
<i>Vuelta</i>	Ell vino so ell agua frida.	c ⁸	a
	<i>No pueden dormir.</i>	B ⁶	b

Table 4. Textual structure of Escobar's *No pueden dormir mis ojos*

The blend of popular and courtly elements is also to the fore in the more theatrical songs with their use of duos for musical and verbal exchange: *Gran plazer siento yo ya* (CMP 385); *¡Oro sus! Pues qu'ansi es* (no. 73); and *¡Que ha, que hu!*, preserved incompletely in the Ourense fragment.⁵⁹ These four-voice settings all share the directness of the bucolic musical and textual style developed by Encina in his pastoral plays. However, each is quite different thematically: *Gran plazer siento yo ya* tells of the requited love between the shepherd and shepherdess who are to marry in six verses

⁵⁸ KNIGHTON, 'Spaces and Contexts' (see note 53). On the form and structure of the *cosaute*, see José ROMEU FIGUERAS, 'El cosaute en la lírica de los cancioneros musicales españoles de los siglos XV-XVI', *Anuario Musical*, 5 (1950), pp. 15-61.

⁵⁹ A reconstruction of all four voices is attempted in KNIGHTON, 'Spanish Songs for Christmas' (see note 12), pp. 460-1.

that draw on exclamations characteristic of Encina's *sayagués*—such as the '¡ho, más ha! that articulates the second and third musical phrases of the refrain—and pastoral language, including items of rustic clothing, birds and flowers, musical instruments such as the bagpipe and recorder, and the dancing associated with a country wedding. All is joy, fun and simple celebration in this idealized pastoral world; the theme recurs in *Nuestra'ama, Minguillo*, a simple, largely homophonic song in bucolic triple time. The musical structure and compositional technique of *Gran plazer siento yo ya* are more refined, including double imitation (in the opening phrases of the *estribillo*), shifts from duple to triple metre, further imitative duets in the *coplas*, and overall the sense of variety in response to each textual phrase more commonly found in the motet (Example 6).⁶⁰ Contrary to the trough-composed motet structure, these phrases have to be repeated to different words in successive strophes, and there is no sense of a music-text relationship other than the introduction of triple time at the end of the *estribillo* and *coplas* to suggest the gaiety of the occasion, as well as, possibly, the choice of the Ionian mode (in effect, C major).⁶¹

Only two voices (superius and tenor) survive of the Christmas song attributed to Escobar in the Ourense fragment, *¡Que hu que ha!*,⁶² but they offer a clear idea of the structure of the song, which shares the features of *Gran plazer siento yo ya*: brief exclamations in all voices and imitative duos before a concise passage of declamatory homophony and a shift to triple time as a nod to the more popular tradition. This song would surely have been performed as part of a court shepherd play in the manner of Encina or Vicente, or in the context of the villancico cycles that drew large audiences to Christmas Matins in the cathedral milieu.⁶³ The carnival song *¡Ora sus! –Pues que así es* (CMP 73) is perhaps the most dramatic and interesting of Escobar's play songs. It opens with an exchange between four shepherds, two of whom are named (Toribio and Bras), which provides the ideal segue from carnival play to concluding villancico in the Encinian manner.⁶⁴ Declamatory

⁶⁰ On Escobar's motets, see Peter Marquis ALEXANDER, 'The Motets of Pedro de Escobar' (Master's thesis, Indiana University, 1976).

⁶¹ STEVENSON (*Spanish Music* (see note 3), p. 280) considers Escobar's choice of mode, pointing out that he uses the mixolydian, associated by Ramos de Pareja with 'saturnine' or despairing emotions in *Lo que queda es lo seguro* and *Vencedores son tus ojos*. However, the anonymous comments on the choice of mode in songs in the Salamanca miscellany suggests 'victory' for mixolydian and prayer and weeping for the hypomixolydian, while Marcos Durán comes up with bravery and daring and calm and peacefulness respectively. The contradictions between theorists makes assessing the mode of a song (whether by the tenor, as Stevenson does, or the melody) a complex affair, although some patterns can be perceived; see Tess KNIGHTON, 'Approaches to Text-Setting in Castilian-Texted Devotional Songs c. 1500', in *French Renaissance Music and Beyond. Studies in Memory of Frank Dobbins*, edited by Marie-Alexis Colin (Turnhout, Brépols, 2018), pp. 427-53.

⁶² KNIGHTON, 'Spanish Songs for Christmas' (see note 12), p. 459.

⁶³ The formality of the hand and layout of the Ourense fragment, apparently originally part of an anthology of Christmas songs, suggests an institutional context, such as, for example, Seville Cathedral; see KNIGHTON, 'Spanish Songs for Christmas' (see note 12), pp. 457-9.

⁶⁴ Romeu Figueras commented on the song's 'indudable movimiento dramático', and the likelihood that 'se cantara en alguna de las representaciones bucólico-populares a la manera de Juan del Encina'; see ROMEU FIGUERAS, *La música* (see note 8), IV-II, p. 282.

homophony and a concluding triple-time phrase invoking ‘San Gorgomillaz’, a pseudo-saint of the pastoral tradition to whom, like San Antruejo in Encina’s *Oy comamos y bebamos* (CMP 174), homage was made in Bacchanalian fashion on Shrove Tuesday.

Ya me re - go - si - jo —

Gran pla - ser sien-to — yo — ya,

Yo me re-go - si - jo —

Gran pla - ser sien-to — yo ya,

7

— yo, Pues d'a - mo - res bien m'i - rá

¡Ho! Pues d'a - mo - res bien m'i - rá

— yo, ¡Mas ha! Pues d'a - mo - res bien m'i - rá

[¡Mas ha!] Pues d'a - mo - res bien m'i - rá.

12

Con la que m'e - na - mo - ró.

Con la que m'e - na - mo - ró.

Con la que m'e - na - mo - ró.

Con la que m'e - na - mo - ró.

Example 6. Escobar, *Gran plaser siento yo ya, estribillo*

		Verse	Music	Metre
<i>Estribillo</i>	<i>¡Ora sus! –Pues así es,</i>	a ⁸	a	A
	<i>¡Ha Toribio! –¿Qué quie[r]es, Bras?</i>	B ⁸	b	
	<i>–Hartemos hasta no más,</i>	B ⁸	c	
	<i>cuant'es qu'eso muy bien es,</i>	A ⁸	d	
	<i>pues qu'es san Gorgomillaz.</i>	B ⁸	e	3
<i>Coplas</i>	<i>–Pues esta noche tenemos,</i>	c ⁸	f	B
	<i>Procuremos el prazer</i>	d ⁸	g	
	<i>Y cuydemo en comer</i>	d ⁸	f	B
	<i>Atanto que rrebentemos.</i>	a ⁸	g	
<i>Vuelta</i>	<i>Ora, pues, ¡sus! ¿Qué hazéis?</i>	a ⁸	a	A
	<i>¡Ha Toribio! –¿Qué quie[r]es, Bras?</i>	B ⁸	b	
	<i>–Hartemos hasta no más,</i>	B ⁸	c	
	<i>cuant'es qu'eso muy bien es,</i>	A ⁸	d	
	<i>pues qu'es san Gorgomillaz.</i>	B ⁸	e	3

Table 5. Textual and musical structure in Escobar's *¡Ora sus!–Pues así es*

Musical phrase d in the *estribillo* is of particular interest (Example 7).⁶⁵ Here Escobar uses the technique referred to as 'caça' (or 'chase') in *contrapunto*:⁶⁶ each voice enters rapidly in imitation in the manner of a *stretto*, the altus first on the *tactus*, and then the bassus, tenor and superius in syncopation which is only resolved at the cadence, having been prolonged by the 4-3 suspension in the superius. This brief passage takes the listener off balance in an effective representation of the excess and drunkenness of the carnival festivities.

As mentioned above, imitation is used rarely in Escobar's song settings in which the music serves as a mnemonic technique and accompaniment to the text which needs to be audible at all times if the meaning – and often the multiple meanings – is to be understood. Other examples of imitation are found in the last phrase of the *estribillo* of another mixed genre (pastoral / courtly) setting, *El día que vy a Pascuala* (CMP 383), in *Vencedores son tus ojos* (CMP 286), one of Escobar's more sophisticated songs with a slightly more extended imitative opening to the *estribillo* / *vuelta*, and in *Quedaos, adiós* (CMP 158) with a fleeting appearance between the two upper voices in the second phrase and between tenor and superius in the third phrase of the *estribillo* / *vuelta*. Together with the concise dialogue at the opening and the four-line *estribillo*, this four-voice song of parting conveys a sense of spaciousness that again evokes Escobar's motet-style, particularly with the dispersal through the texture of the rhythmic pattern dotted semibreve–minim–semibreve which appears not only in the *estribillo* but also in the second phrase of the *coplas* (Example 8).

⁶⁵ Romeu Figueras points out Anglés's erroneous reading of this line, which in his edition reads: 'Ánimates, que son muy blancos'; see ROMEU FIGUERAS, *La música* (see note 8), IV-II, p. 282.

⁶⁶ FIORENTINO, 'Unwritten Music' (see note 47), p. 517.

¿Qué quies Bras? Har-te-mos has

—¡Ha To - ri - bio! Har-te-mos has

Pues qu'an - sí es. Har-te-mos has

¡O - ra sus! Har-te-mos has

7

ta no más, cuan - t'es qu'e - so muy bien

ta no más, cuan - te's qu'e - so, cuant'es qu'e so muy bien

ta no más, cuan - t'es qu'es - so muy bien

ta no más, cuan - t'es qu'e - so, cuan - t'es qu'e - so muy bien

13

es, Pues qu'es San Gor - go mi - llaz.

es, Pues qu'es San Gor - go mi - llaz.

es, Pues qu'es San Gor - go mi - llaz.

es, Pues qu'es San Gor - go mi - llaz.

Example 7. Escobar: *¡Ora sus! –Pues que así es, estribillo*

Que - daos, a - diós,
Y os de - xa - mos.

—¿A dón - de vais?
—¿Por qué os vais?

¡O cui -
¡O cui -

Que _____ va - mos des - es - - pe - ra -

Que _____ va - mos _____ des -

ta - dos! Que _____ va - mos des - es - pe - ra -
ta - dos! Que _____ va - mos des - es - pe - ra -

dos, ¿Pa - - ra
-es - pe - ra - - dos, ¿Pa - - ra
dos, ¿Pa - - ra qué
dos, ¿Pa - - ra -

15

qué lo pre - gun - táis?

qué lo pre - gun - táis?

lo pre - gun - táis?

qué lo pre - gun - táis?

Example 8. Escobar, *Quedaos, adiós*, estribillo and vuelta

		Verse	Music	Cadence
Estribillo	– <i>Quedaos, adiós!</i> –¿ <i>Adónde vais?</i>	a ⁸	a	A
	–¿ <i>O cuitados,</i>	B ⁴	b	E
	<i>que vamos desesperados!</i>	B ⁸	c	A
	¿ <i>Para qué lo preguntáis?</i>	A ⁸	d	A
Coplas	¿ <i>Cómo podremos sufrir</i>	c ⁸	e	B
	<i>Tal dolor y tal manzilla?</i>	d ⁸	f	A
	<i>Que nos vamos de Sevilla</i>	d ⁸	e	B
	<i>A buscar nuevo morir,</i>	c ⁸	f	A
Vuelta	<i>Y os dexamos. –¿Por qué os vais?</i>	d ⁸	a	A
	–¿ <i>O cuitados,</i>	B ⁴	b	E
	<i>que vamos desesperados!</i>	B ⁸	c	A
	¿ <i>Para qué lo preguntáis?</i>	A ⁸	d	A

Table 6. Textual and musical structure of Escobar's *Quedaos, adiós*

The hypophrygian mode, with the recurrence of cadences on A (minor), may well have been chosen by Escobar as, according to the paragraph on the choice of modes in the Salamanca miscellany, it was associated with suffering.⁶⁷ The opening exchange, including the *pie quebrado*, and the pervasive dotted rhythm compound the sense of urgency and desperation expressed by the text. Can this very effective song, with its mention of Seville, be considered autobiographical like Encina's *Quédate, carillo, adiós*?⁶⁸ Juan Ruiz Jiménez's research in the cathedral archive has confirmed that Escobar continued as chapel master at Seville throughout 1513 and during the very

⁶⁷ KNIGHTON, 'Approaches to Text-Setting' (see note 61), p. 432.

⁶⁸ The similarity in the first line of each song is clear, as is the valedictory nature of both texts with specific reference to a city or town, though no further reference to Encina's song appears to have been made by Escobar.

early part of 1514; he was replaced later that year by Pedro Hernández.⁶⁹ As Stevenson pointed out, no mention is made of Escobar's death in the chapter acts, and he suggested that Escobar may have left because he was dissatisfied with the chapter's treatment of him, for example because of poor recompense for being master of the boys.⁷⁰ Is it possible that Escobar's sudden and unrecorded departure from Seville is reflected in this song? The reference to 'tal manzilla' and, in the second strophe to 'Nuestras glorias son perdidas', might suggest that he left unceremoniously under a cloud. The poet (or poet-composer) did not wish to leave—'Pues quedan los coraçones'—but his life, along with that of his companion(s) (hence the use of the first-person plural), is in danger: 'peligrosas van las vidas'. The second line of the second verse—'cobradas muchas pasiones'—also hints at a love affair: could an illicit passion (whether with a woman or a choirboy) have been discovered by or been brought to the attention of the cathedral authorities and resulted in Escobar's glittering career coming to an abrupt end, forcing him to flee Seville with his companion/beloved? Such a disgrace might explain why his name does not reappear in an institutional (or, indeed, any other) context after the early part of 1514. *Quedaos, adiós* is an unusual song among Escobar's *cancionero* output, in structure, style and content: it opens with a mini-dialogue but nothing else suggests that it formed part of a play; and its more expansive *estribillo* / *vuelta* demonstrates his skill as a composer, even if his reputation may have been damaged by events of a more personal nature.

Only three of the lyric poems set by Escobar are known to be by established and highly regarded court poets such as Garci Sánchez de Badajoz or Juan del Encina; might he, like they, have written, at least on occasion, his own verse and embedded, as did they, autobiographical elements there? Did he, in fact, know both men? The relatively high number of his songs in the *Palace Songbook*, the marked influence of Encina on his song idiom, and a possible association with Sánchez de Badajoz suggest a connection. Perhaps at some earlier point in his career Escobar served in aristocratic circles near to the border between Portugal, possibly even visiting or staying at the court of the Counts of Feria in Zafra, where Sánchez de Badajoz enjoyed the patronage of Gómez Suarez de Figueroa, II Count of Feria (1461-1506) and his successors. This is, of course, mere hypothesis, but it is just possible that Escobar's *Quedaos adiós*, like so much of the *cancionero* repertory, contains a hidden message.

⁶⁹ Private communication of 24 June 2017; some of this information is also available on-line at <<http://historicalsounds.com/evento229/sevilla/es> and [evento230/sevilla/es](http://historicalsounds.com/evento230/sevilla/es)> (accessed 10 September 2018).

⁷⁰ STEVENSON, *Spanish Music* (see note 3), pp. 170-1.

Tess Knighton has been an ICREA Research Professor affiliated to the Institució Milà i Fontanals–CSIC in Barcelona since 2011 and is an Emeritus Fellow of Clare College, Cambridge. For many years Editor of *Early Music* (OUP), she is founder and series co-editor (with Helen Deeming) of The Boydell Press's Studies in Medieval and Renaissance Music, and Secretary to the Editorial Board of the *Monumentos de la Música Española*. She has published widely on many aspects of music in the Iberian world during the later Middle Ages and Renaissance, and recent volumes include the *Companion to Music in the Age of the Catholic Monarchs* (Brill, 2017) and *Hearing the City in Early Modern Europe* (Brepols, 2018).

Recebido em | *Received* 20/10/2018

Aceite em | *Accepted* 13/12/2018